(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), 17 West 32nd Street, (aka 17-21 West 32nd Street), Manhattan. Built 1902-04; architect, Harry B. Mulliken.

Landmark Site: Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 834, Lot 29

On October 31, 2000, the Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation of the (former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel) and the proposed designation of the related Landmark Site (Item. No. 2). The hearing was duly advertised according to the provisions of law. Two witnesses spoke in favor of the designation, including a representative of the Historic Districts Council. There were no speakers in opposition to the proposed designation. In addition, the Commission received a letter in support of designation from the owner of the building.

Summary

The Aberdeen Hotel was built in 1902-04 as an apartment hotel to the designs of architect Harry B. Mulliken for the Old Colony Company, a real estate development firm. At that time, the Herald Square area was a center of entertainment with theaters, restaurants, clubs, and hotels, as well as a major transportation hub, while Fifth Avenue in the Thirties was developing as a major shopping district. In 1912, the hotel’s suites were subdivided and it began to accept transient guests; during the 1920s, the Aberdeen became one of the first hotels in the city to admit women travelers unaccompanied by men without subjecting them to strict rules. The brick and limestone structure is a significant example of an ornate, early-twentieth-century, Beaux-arts style apartment hotel building. Notable features include the rusticated stone base, the elaborate sculptural entryway with oversized Atlantes, the projecting central bay of windows with decorative metal spandrel panels, and the broken pediment that surmounts the central bay at the tenth story. The exterior of the hotel remains largely intact. It is now the Best Western Manhattan Hotel.
DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS

Development of the Area

Near the end of the nineteenth century, the area of Broadway and West 34th Street, known as Herald Square, gained prominence as an important entertainment district. Similar to the city’s residential districts, the entertainment district moved progressively north along Broadway during the nineteenth century. By the 1880s, Broadway between 23rd and 42nd streets was known as New York’s glittering “Great White Way,” because of all the electric lights along this section of the street. The Metropolitan Opera House, located at Broadway and 39th Street, opened in 1883 and sparked a theatrical move further uptown. The Casino Theater, the Manhattan Opera House, and Harrigan’s (later the Herald Square Theater) were all soon located nearby. In 1893 the Empire Theatre opened at Broadway and West 41st Street, sparking further development in the area of Longacre Square (later called Times Square). Saks & Co, and R.H. Macy’s anchored the shopping district at West 34th Street, having led the move northward, beginning in 1901-02, of department stores from below Madison Square. Restaurants such as Recto's and Delmonico's satisfied the gastronomical needs of the area’s clientele, while hotels such as the Marlborough, the Normandie, and the Vendome, provided accommodations. The architecture of these theaters, stores, and hotels tended to be exuberantly-ornamented revival styles.

To the east, Fifth Avenue had a somewhat more subdued architectural and social atmosphere, established by B. Altman, Tiffany, and the Gorham Silver Company stores, as well as the Knickerbocker Club. This was confirmed by the opening, in 1893 and 1897, of the lavish Waldorf Hotel and Astoria Hotel on Fifth Avenue, between 33rd and 34th streets. The Herald Square area was also a transportation hub, ensuring continued development. Crosstown streetcars, the Sixth Avenue Elevated, and the Hudson Tubes to New Jersey had stops at Sixth Avenue and 34th Street. One block to the west, Pennsylvania Station, which would provide passenger railway facilities, was being planned.

Hotel Architecture

Hotels played an important role in the life of the city throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. For many years the Astor House, built in 1836 by Isaiah Rogers, located on Broadway between Barclay and Vesey Streets, was the city’s most renowned hotel. As the population moved northward, so did the hotel district. By 1859, the Fifth Avenue Hotel, called the "first modern New York Hotel," opened on Madison Square, offering its patrons amenities such as New York's first passenger elevator and luxuriously decorated interiors. During the course of the nineteenth century, hotels became increasingly larger and more luxurious. Perhaps the ultimate in nineteenth century hotel splendor was architect Henry J. Hardenbergh’s Waldorf Hotel and Astoria Hotel (which functioned as one hotel), and had 1,300 bedrooms and 40 public rooms, all lavishly and individually decorated.

The Waldorf and Astoria complex, however, was not the only grand hotel built in the late nineteenth century. Fostered by economic prosperity, the large luxury hotels of this period became the venue for public life, supplying halls for promenading, dining rooms to be seen in, and private rooms in which to entertain and be entertained. Improvements in transportation during the late nineteenth century made travel between and within cities easier, and people began to travel for pleasure as well as business. By the early twentieth century, the tendency was observed to "include within the walls of the building all the possible comforts of modern life, facilities which formerly could be found only outside of the hotel walls. Telephones, Turkish baths, private nurses, physicians..." in addition to laundry, maids, valets, barbers, hairdressers, and shoe shine boys. A large staff was required to supply such services, which in turn necessitated a building that was large enough to make the whole enterprise financially sound.

The Waldorf and Astoria Hotels’ warm-colored brick, elaborate ornament, and strong roofline provided a stylistic exemplar for other hotels. Other architects, like as Harry B. Mulliken in his Aberdeen
Hotel, were influenced Hardenbergh’s influential hotel designs. In 1905, the architectural critic A. C. David proclaimed that the large, new American hotels were "in a different class architecturally from any similar buildings which have preceded them."\textsuperscript{10} These tall buildings were constructed with steel-frames, like skyscrapers, but were created "in such a manner that it would be distinguished from the office-building and suggest some relation to domestic life."\textsuperscript{11} David praised the use of warm materials, especially brick, and admired the strong roof lines. Mulliken's Aberdeen Hotel is one of the more exuberant manifestations of the fascination that American architects had with Parisian architecture in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Notable features include the rusticated stone base, the elaborate sculptural entrance with oversize Atlantes, the projecting central bay of windows with decorative metal spandrel panels, and the broken pediment that surmounts the central bay at the tenth story. The elaborate brick and limestone facade of the Aberdeen is a significant surviving example of the ornate, early-twentieth-century, Beaux-arts-style hotel building in New York.

**Apartment Hotels**\textsuperscript{12}

During the 1880s, apartment hotels catering to those who maintained residences outside the city and could not afford, or did not desire, to maintain a city residence, began to be constructed in New York City. These hotels provided suites of rooms that were serviced by the hotel staff; thus, guests did not need servants. By 1905, it was estimated that there were almost 100 such establishments in "in the central part of Manhattan."\textsuperscript{13}

Apartment hotels were intended to house permanent and transient, but long term, tenants as well as small families, in suites and single rooms, furnished or unfurnished. All were without kitchen facilities and, instead, the apartment hotel employed full-service staffs and provided ground floor breakfast rooms and restaurants. The first wave of apartment hotel construction occurred between 1889 and 1895. Apartment hotels became so numerous that they sparked a backlash among New York's social establishment, who considered the idea of unrelated people living under one roof as vulgar.

A second wave of apartment hotel construction followed the passage of the new building code in 1899 and the Tenement House Law in 1901. The Aberdeen Hotel was built during this period. Under the Tenement House Law, apartment hotels were classified as hotels rather than tenements (i.e regular apartment buildings). Therefore, apartment hotel construction was exempt from the stringent tenement house law and regulated only by the more flexible building code, as applied to commercial buildings. (Hotels were considered commercial rather than residential buildings.) As a consequence, apartment hotels could be less fireproof, taller, cover a larger portion of the lot, and contain more units than apartment houses, giving builders a better financial return.\textsuperscript{14}

The third wave of apartment hotel construction, driven by economic prosperity in the 1920s, ended with the Great Depression.\textsuperscript{15} The passage of the Multiple Dwelling Act of 1929 altered height and bulk restrictions and permitted "skyscraper" apartment buildings for the first time, which eliminated the economic advantages of apartment hotels. This law, combined with rising labor costs and the onset of the Great Depression, effectively marked the end of the apartment hotels, most of which have now been converted to conventional apartments.

**The Aberdeen Hotel**\textsuperscript{16}

In late 1901, J.R. Todd, Henry Clay Irons, and Willard Barse incorporated the Old Colony Company, a real estate development firm, with a capitalization of $100,000. On June 3, 1902, Old Colony acquired three lots with masonry houses on West 32nd Street between Fifth Avenue and Broadway from the Alliance Realty Company. In August, architect Harry B. Mulliken filed an application on behalf of the Old Colony Company with the New York City Department of Buildings to construct a twelve-story hotel on the site. Old Colony’s decision to develop its newly-acquired parcel on West 32nd Street as an apartment hotel made economic sense. With Herald Square an entertainment center and its importance as a transportation hub increasing with the proposed Pennsylvania Station, even more people would be going to the area’s theaters, restaurants, and hotels. The trade magazine, *New York Hotel Record*, reported in April 1903 that the Old Colony Company has secured financing for its hotel project from the Alliance Realty Company and the Metropolitan Life Insurance Company for $207,130 and $400,000, respectively. Construction of the hotel began on May 3, 1903. The 154-room hotel was finished on September 15, 1904. Afterwards the Old Colony Company leased the building to the Thirty-Second Street Hotel Company, which managed the hotel for the next several years.

The Old Colony Company sold the Aberdeen in 1908 to Richard Howell, who retained the Thirty-Second Street Hotel Company’s management lease.
Howell declared bankruptcy in 1912 and the hotel was acquired by Louis Markel, who terminated the existing management lease, entering into a new lease with the Aberdeen Hotel Company, Inc., which increased the number of rooms by dividing up many of the suites in order to accommodate transient guests. The latter company, which purchased the building from Markel in 1915, continued to own and operate the hotel into the 1930s.

In the 1920s, the Aberdeen became one of a growing number of transient hotels to admit women travelers unaccompanied by men without subjecting them to strict rules. Most hotels at the time refused to register women arriving alone during nighttime hours, and did not permit registered single female guests to return to the hotel after dark. Some hotels restricted single women to particular floors only. A number of hotels, such as the Martha Washington (29 East 29th Street) and the Allerton House (130 East 57th Street, now an office building), were open to women only and kept them under even closer supervision. According to Rider’s, only the Aberdeen, the Great Northern Hotel, at 118 West 57th Street, and the Hotel Willard, at 252 West 76th Street treated men and women as equals.

The exterior of the Aberdeen Hotel has remained largely intact. The building’s original stoop was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were installed on the first floor in 1933, and the cornice was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were largely intact. The building’s original stoop was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were installed on the first floor in 1933, and the cornice was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were largely intact. The building’s original stoop was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were installed on the first floor in 1933, and the cornice was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were largely intact. The building’s original stoop was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were installed on the first floor in 1933, and the cornice was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were largely intact. The building’s original stoop was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were installed on the first floor in 1933, and the cornice was replaced with a smaller one in 1914, storefronts were largely intact.

The five-bay, seven-story central section features a multi-story, projecting central bay with a rusticated limestone surround, and a surmounting, broken pediment containing a window. The surround features carved lions’ faces and garlands at the lower stories. The projecting bays consist of galvanized iron containing decorative columns and elaborate spandrels featuring cartouches and garlands. The carved limestone surround is supported by elaborate brackets encrusted with carved shells, foliation, and floral patterns. The sill of the pediment window has elaborately-carved floral decorations and a cartouche. It is topped by a foliated keystone and festoons. The end bays of the central section consist of keyed limestone ashlars featuring bracketed window lintels, splayed lintels with prominent keystones, brick panels, and carved decoration of cartouches, festoons, and garlands. The other end of the central section features the south story, the second-floor sills and an attached, non-historic flagpole. The entryway contains recessed steps and non-historic doors topped by a glass transom with an elaborate wrought-iron grille. It is flanked by non-historic commercial sign plaques. An elaborate, cast-iron spandrel sits below the second-story window, which contains non-historic sash and an elaborate wrought-iron railing. Giant, scrolled and foliated brackets sit upon the pedestals and support a wide, undulating convex molding above the third story. The portico is flanked by historic wall lamps and flagpoles.

A non-historic, one-story storefront is located on the east side of the base. It contains non-historic signage, plate-glass show windows, polished metal columns, signage, and fixed box awning. A similar non-historic box awning is situated above the first-story windows at the west side of the base. The second-story fenestration features wide, convex sills, scrolled ironwork, and splayed lintels with prominent keystones. Shallow, projecting end bays on the third story feature bracketed balconies enclosed by balustrades, quoined surrounds, and splayed keystones flanked by floral carvings. The other windows on the third story have either flat, stone sills and lintels, or balustraded balconettes and splayed keystones flanked by carved medallions.

The five-bay, seven-story central section features a multi-story, projecting central bay with a rusticated limestone surround, and a surmounting, broken pediment containing a window. The surround features carved lions’ faces and garlands at the lower stories. The projecting bays consist of galvanized iron containing decorative columns and elaborate spandrels featuring cartouches and garlands. The carved limestone pediment is supported by elaborate brackets encrusted with carved shells, foliation, and floral patterns. The sill of the pediment window has elaborately-carved floral decorations and a cartouche. It is topped by a foliated keystone and festoons. The end bays of the central section consist of keyed limestone ashlars featuring bracketed window lintels, splayed lintels with prominent keystones, brick panels, and carved decoration of cartouches, festoons, and garlands. The other end of the central section features the south story, the second-floor sills and an attached, non-historic flagpole. The entryway contains recessed steps and non-historic doors topped by a glass transom with an elaborate wrought-iron grille. It is flanked by non-historic commercial sign plaques. An elaborate, cast-iron spandrel sits below the second-story window, which contains non-historic sash and an elaborate wrought-iron railing. Giant, scrolled and foliated brackets sit upon the pedestals and support a wide, undulating convex molding above the third story. The portico is flanked by historic wall lamps and flagpoles.

A non-historic, one-story storefront is located on the east side of the base. It contains non-historic signage, plate-glass show windows, polished metal columns, signage, and fixed box awning. A similar non-historic box awning is situated above the first-story windows at the west side of the base. The second-story fenestration features wide, convex sills, scrolled ironwork, and splayed lintels with prominent keystones. Shallow, projecting end bays on the third story feature bracketed balconies enclosed by balustrades, quoined surrounds, and splayed keystones flanked by floral carvings. The other windows on the third story have either flat, stone sills and lintels, or balustraded balconettes and splayed keystones flanked by carved medallions.

The five-bay, seven-story central section features a multi-story, projecting central bay with a rusticated limestone surround, and a surmounting, broken pediment containing a window. The surround features carved lions’ faces and garlands at the lower stories. The projecting bays consist of galvanized iron containing decorative columns and elaborate spandrels featuring cartouches and garlands. The carved limestone pediment is supported by elaborate brackets encrusted with carved shells, foliation, and floral patterns. The sill of the pediment window has elaborately-carved floral decorations and a cartouche. It is topped by a foliated keystone and festoons. The end bays of the central section consist of keyed limestone ashlars featuring bracketed window lintels, splayed lintels with prominent keystones, brick panels, and carved decoration of cartouches, festoons, and garlands. The other end of the central section features the south story, the second-floor sills and an attached, non-historic flagpole. The entryway contains recessed steps and non-historic doors topped by a glass transom with an elaborate wrought-iron grille. It is flanked by non-historic commercial sign plaques. An elaborate, cast-iron spandrel sits below the second-story window, which contains non-historic sash and an elaborate wrought-iron railing. Giant, scrolled and foliated brackets sit upon the pedestals and support a wide, undulating convex molding above the third story. The portico is flanked by historic wall lamps and flagpoles.

The five-bay, seven-story central section features a multi-story, projecting central bay with a rusticated limestone surround, and a surmounting, broken pediment containing a window. The surround features carved lions’ faces and garlands at the lower stories. The projecting bays consist of galvanized iron containing decorative columns and elaborate spandrels featuring cartouches and garlands. The carved limestone pediment is supported by elaborate brackets encrusted with carved shells, foliation, and floral patterns. The sill of the pediment window has elaborately-carved floral decorations and a cartouche. It is topped by a foliated keystone and festoons. The end bays of the central section consist of keyed limestone ashlars featuring bracketed window lintels, splayed lintels with prominent keystones, brick panels, and carved decoration of cartouches, festoons, and garlands. The other end of the central section features the south story, the second-floor sills and an attached, non-historic flagpole. The entryway contains recessed steps and non-historic doors topped by a glass transom with an elaborate wrought-iron grille. It is flanked by non-historic commercial sign plaques. An elaborate, cast-iron spandrel sits below the second-story window, which contains non-historic sash and an elaborate wrought-iron railing. Giant, scrolled and foliated brackets sit upon the pedestals and support a wide, undulating convex molding above the third story. The portico is flanked by historic wall lamps and flagpoles.
flanked by richly-carved ornamentation, consisting of cartouches, masks, and foliation. The windows are topped by prominent keystones; those at the twelfth story are foliated. The brick bays have keyed, limestone surrounds, bracketed sills, festooned spandrels, and splayed keystones, also foliated at the twelfth story.

The facade is topped by a bracketed, metal cornice that has been modified from the original and has attached, non-historic lighting. The majority of windows contain non-historic sash. The brick, exposed west elevation contains lot-line windows with flat, stone lintels and non-historic sash. The upper part of the utilitarian west elevation has been repointed. The upper part of the west light court also contains non-historic sash with flat, stone lintels.

Report prepared by:
Donald G. Presa
Research Department

NOTES

1. This section was adapted from Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC), Hotel Martinique (LP-1983), (New York: City of New York, 1998), report prepared by Virginia Kurshan, Research Department, and includes the following sources: Maxwell F. Marcuse, This Was New York! (NY: Lim Press, 1969), 130-133, 180-185, 395; Michael and Ariane Batterberry, On the Town in New York, From 1776 to the Present (NY: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1973), 133, 170; and Mary C. Henderson, The City and the Theatre (Clifton, NJ: James T. White & Co., 1973), 131-139.


4. Not only was the building very large, but it was equipped with the latest facilities, including a bath and toilet on every floor.


6. This phenomenon continued well into the twentieth century. In 1923, Rider's New York noted that the modern American hotel was "not merely a hotel, but in a certain sense a public resort, frequented daily by a vast floating population comprised not only of casual strangers, but of resident New Yorkers, who take an unlicensed, yet undisputed advantage of a large proportion of the accommodations and privileges intended for the guests of the house. Any well-dressed stranger can enter unchallenged, use the parlors and sitting rooms as meeting places for social or business purposes, finish a day's correspondence on the hotel stationery..."

7. In addition, hotels enhanced their sense of luxury by adding all the latest technological advancements, including electricity, elevators, telephones, and central heat.


9. Hutchins, 621.

11. Ibid.


15. Apartment hotels built during this period introduced “bootleg kitchens” – a true kitchenette – into their suites, which were intended to warm up food provided by room service. Under the law, however, the stoves were still not allowed in living units of apartment hotels, but the law was not strictly enforced. Many existing apartment hotels were retrofitted in this manner. The situation became a matter of public controversy.

16. This section is based on the following sources: *Atlas of the City of New York and Part of the Bronx* (New York: E. Robinson, 1885), pl. 13; New York City Department of Buildings, Borough of Manhattan, NB 495-1902; New York County, Office of the Register, Deeds Liber 40, Page 339 (Nov. 20, 1895); Liber 45, Page 159 (Jun. 15, 1896); Liber 72, Page 273 (Mar. 5, 1901); Liber 80, Pages 458 & 459 (Mar. 3, 1902); Liber 82, Page 302 (Jun. 3, 1902); Lease Liber 101, Page 269 (Aug. 4, 1904); *New York Hotel Record*, April 28, 1903, p. 3; Nov. 22, 1904, p. 3; Nov. 20, 1906, p. 8; *and Real Estate Record and Guide*, Dec. 7, 1901, p. 774; August 9, 1902, p. 214.


19. The latter two hotels have been converted to apartment houses.
FINDINGS AND DESIGNATION

On the basis of careful consideration of the history, the architecture, and other features of this building, the Landmarks Preservation Commission finds that the (former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel) has a special character and special historical and aesthetic interest and value as part of the development, heritage, and cultural characteristics of New York City.

The Commission further finds that, among its important qualities, the Aberdeen Hotel was built in 1902-04 to the designs of architect Harry B. Mulliken for the Old Colony Company; that at the time the Aberdeen was built, the Herald Square area was a center of entertainment, including theaters, restaurants, clubs, and hotels, as well as a major transportation hub, while Fifth Avenue in the Thirties was developing as a major shopping district; that in 1912, the hotel began to accept transient guests and during the 1920s, the Aberdeen became one of the first hotels in the city to cater to women guests traveling alone; that the brick and limestone Aberdeen is one of the more exuberant manifestations of the fascination that American architects had with Parisian architecture at the turn of the century; that notable features include the rusticated stone base, the elaborate sculptural entryway with oversized Atlantes, the projecting central bay of windows with decorative metal spandrel panels, and the broken pediment that surmounts the central bay at the tenth story; and that the exterior of the hotel remains largely intact.

Accordingly, pursuant to provisions of Chapter 74, Section 3020 of the Charter of the City of New York and Chapter 3 of Title 25 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission designates as a Landmark the (former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), 17 West 32nd Street, (aka 17-21 West 32nd Street) and designates Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 834, Lot 29 as its Landmark Site.
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel)
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

Photo: Carl Forster
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), detail at base of facade
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), carved ornament at the third story
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

Photos: Carl Forster
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), entryway
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), entryway detail
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

Photos: Carl Forster
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), upper facade detail
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

Photos: Carl Forster
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), upper facade detail
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), upper facade detail
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

Photos: Carl Forster
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel), upper facade and west elevation
17-21 West 32nd Street, Manhattan

Photo: Carl Forster
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel) 17 West 32\textsuperscript{nd} Street (aka 17-21 West 32\textsuperscript{nd} Street), Manhattan

Landmark Site: Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 834, Lot 29. Graphic Source: New York City Department of Finance, City Surveyor, Tax Map.
(Former) Aberdeen Hotel (now Best Western Manhattan Hotel) 17 West 32nd Street (aka 17-21 West 32nd Street), Manhattan
Landmark Site: Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 834, Lot 29. Graphic Source: *The Sanborn Manhattan Land Book of New York, 20th ed.* (Weehawken, NJ: First Real Estate Solutions, 1999), Plate 60